Pursuing Sustainability: A framework for Linking Science and Practice

Presented at
Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research
June 17, 2016
by
Bill Clark
Harvey Brooks Professor of International Science, Public Policy and Human Development
Harvard University
(william_clark@harvard.edu)
Why a framework?
Progress in tackling Schellnhuber’s

Grand Challenges of Sustainability Science

1. Normative challenges
   * Inclusive human well-being that does not decline should be the overall goal of sustainable development

2. Analytic challenges
   * Stocks of capital assets are the ultimate determinants, state variables, and metrics of sustainable development

3. Operational challenges
   * Sustainability transitions needed in how assets are harnessed in essential production-consumption systems

4. Strategic challenges
   * Informed agitation needed for sustainability transitions
1) Normative Challenges: Goals for Sustainable Development?

“Humanity has the ability to make development sustainable:

To ensure that it meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.”

(WCED, 1987)
Proliferation of normative goals...

• Examples...
  – Amartya Sen’s “Human freedoms / capabilities”
  – OECD’s individual “Better life” constituents
  – UN’s new 17 “International SDGs…”

• Common ground?
  – Developing *people*, not (just) protecting environment
  – Concern for equity, justice, future generations
  – Need for fit to local contexts
An emerging way forward…

• What is to be developed? *Human well-being*
  – Human centered, but advancing “well-being” as less austere vision than merely meeting “needs”
  – Conservation of nature is a possible *means* for, but not an *end* of, sustainable development

• What of equity? *Inclusive* human well-being
  – Fair division of opportunities for advancing well-being across space and time

• Bottom line: Goal of sustainable development is
  – inclusive human well-being doesn’t decline with time
1) Normative Challenges: non-declining inclusive human well-being as goal of sustainability

Goal: Well-being

Social-Environmental System

Constituents of Well-being

- Material needs
- Health and education
- Flourishing biota
- Capabilities...
- ... & their distribution
2) Analytic Challenges

• What are the ultimate determinants of inclusive human well-being (W), and thus of sustainable development?
2) Analytic challenges: Determinants of sustainability...

- Well-being ultimately derived from stocks of capital assets
- Assets are the state variables of the SES → *determinants* of sustainability
- But *which* assets?

**Social-Environmental System**

- **Goal of Well-being**

- **Capital Assets**
### Determinants of Inclusive Well-being
(And tribes of scientists that study them)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Asset cluster</th>
<th>Includes... “state variables” related to...</th>
<th>Studied by scholars of...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural capital</td>
<td>Environmental system, its ecology, climate, soils, biodiversity, minerals, etc.</td>
<td>Earth systems science, conservation biology, ecosystem services, ecological economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufactured capital</td>
<td>Industrial system: factories, roads, cities, infrastructure for energy, telecom, etc.</td>
<td>Industrial ecology, green design, pollution control; sustainability engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human capital</td>
<td>Individuals: number/distribution, health, education, networks</td>
<td>Demography, consumption behavior, environmental health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social capital</td>
<td>Arrangements (economic, political, cultural) governing interactions (rules, norms, trust)</td>
<td>Political economy, institutions, policy science, managing the commons, governance, sociology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge capital</td>
<td>Scientific findings, technology, practical skills and expertise</td>
<td>Research policy, innovation, STS, boundary work, social learning...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2) Determinants of sustainability: Statics

Social-Environmental System

Goal of Well-being

Capital Assets

- Material needs
  - Health and education
  - Flourishing biota
  - Capabilities
  - ... & their distribution

Analytic challenge is determining how assets interact in SES to shape Well-being

- Human capital ($C_h$)
- Natural capital ($C_n$)
- Manufactured capital ($C_m$)
- Knowledge capital ($C_k$)
- Social capital ($C_s$)
2) Determinants of sustainability: Dynamics

Goal of Well-being

Social-Environmental System
- Complex adaptive dynamics
- Externalities (time, space)
- Non-linearities, tipping points
- Novelty (innovation, evolution)
  - Emergent properties (vulnerability, resilience)
  - Etc...

Capital Assets

- Material needs
  - Health and education
  - Flourishing biota
  - Capabilities...
  - ... & their distribution

Analytic challenge is determining how assets interact in SES to shape Well-being

- Human capital ($C_h$)
- Natural capital ($C_n$)
- Manufactured capital ($C_m$)
- Knowledge capital ($C_k$)
- Social capital ($C_s$)
3) Operational challenges

Goal of Well-being

Social-Environmental System
- Complex adaptive dynamics
- Externalities (time, space)
- Non-linearities, tipping points
- Novelty (innovation, evolution)
  - Emergent properties
    - (vulnerability, resilience)
  - Etc...

Capital Assets

- Human capital \( (C_h) \)
- Natural capital \( (C_n) \)
- Manufactured capital \( (C_m) \)
- Knowledge capital \( (C_k) \)
- Social capital \( (C_s) \)

Managing assets to achieve goals

Material needs
Health and education
Flourishing biota
Capabilities...
... & their distribution

Material needs
Health and education
Flourishing biota
Capabilities...
... & their distribution
3) Operational challenges

- Harnessing *assets* to achieve *goals* takes place through particular PCS (production-consumption systems) embedded in overall SES (social-environmental system) [e.g. energy PCS]

- Operational work must look beyond improvements in particular technologies, policies, consumption habits to...

- Promote *sustainability transitions* in full production-consumption systems
  - German Energiewende, Brazil Forest Transition
Operational Challenges: System transitions in harnessing assets to achieve goals

Goals of SD

Consumption Processes

Goods & Services

Production Processes

Capital Assets

Material needs
Health and education
Environment/biota
Safety
... & their distribution

Transitions in Production-Consumption Systems

Human capital ($C_h$)
Natural capital ($C_n$)
Manufactured capital ($C_m$)
Knowledge capital ($C_k$)
Social capital ($C_s$)
Germany’s Energiewende
(Bruttostromerzeugung, Mrd. kWh)
3) **Operational challenges**: Toward a theory of Transition Management in Production-Consumption Systems

(Geels et al., 2002)
4) Strategic challenges

How can ‘agents’ better promote transitions to sustainability?

Goals of SD

Consumption Processes

Goods & Services

Production Processes

Capital Assets

Material needs
Health and education
Environment/biota
Safety
... & their distribution

Human capital \( (C_h) \)
Natural capital \( (C_n) \)
Manufactured capital \( (C_m) \)
Knowledge capital \( (C_k) \)
Social capital \( (C_s) \)
4) Strategic challenges: Action to promote sustainability transitions

- Goals of SD:
  - Consumption Processes
  - Goods & Services
  - Production Processes

- Capital Assets:
  - Human capital ($C_h$)
  - Natural capital ($C_n$)
  - Manufactured capital ($C_m$)
  - Knowledge capital ($C_k$)
  - Social capital ($C_s$)

- Material needs:
  - Health and education
  - Environment/biota
  - Safety

- Health and education
- Environment/biota
- Safety
- ... & their distribution

"Informed agitation" for an unequally empowered world...

Actors, power & agency
4) Strategic challenges: Informed **Agitation** Governance for Sustainability

- **External forces**
  - **Actors and agency**
    - Values
    - Knowledge
    - Interest
    - Power
    - Capacity
  - **Political processes**
    - Transparency
    - Accountability
    - Representation
    - Legitimacy
  - **Institutional arrangements**
    - Property rights
    - Regulations
    - Policy
    - Incentives
  - **Action**
    - Behavior
    - Decisions
    - Management practices
  - **Asset stocks**
    - Social capital
    - Natural capital
    - Human capital
    - Knowledge capital
    - Manufactured capital

- **Monitoring and enforcement, learning, adaptation**
Informing agitation: What scientists need to know and to do
One Framework for Analyzing Sustainable Development
(use by World Bank, UNEP, scholars)
Useful in organizing interdisciplinary perspectives to understand the elephant of sustainable development?
And in harnessing that understanding to help guide the herd... the ultimate Grand Challenge of Sustainability Science
Progress in tackling Schellnhuber’s

**Grand Challenges of Sustainability Science**

1. **Normative challenges**
   * *Inclusive human well-being* that does not decline should be the overall goal of sustainable development

2. **Analytic challenges**
   * *Stocks of capital assets* are the ultimate determinants, state variables, and metrics of sustainable development

3. **Operational challenges**
   * *Sustainability transitions* needed in how assets are harnessed in essential production-consumption systems

4. **Strategic challenges**
   * *Informed agitation* needed for sustainability transitions
Pursuing Sustainability: 
Further Information

• Sustainability Science Program @ Harvard (This presentation and related materials )
  – www.hks.harvard.edu/centers/mrcbg/programs/sustsci

• PNAS Sustainability Science (current research)
  – http://sustainability.pnas.org/

• Annual Review of Environment and Resources (reviews of core topics in sustainability science)
  – http://arjournals.annualreviews.org/loi/energy

• Pursuing sustainability: A guide to the science and practice (new book by Pam Matson, Bill Clark, Krister Andersson; Princeton Univ. Press 2016)
  – http://pursuingsustainability.org